IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS

LUFKIN DIVISION

OCT 01 2015
Clerk, U.S. District Court

CHARLES RARY

٧.

CIV ACTION NO 9:13-cv-120

PAUL TOLLY ET AL

PLAINTIFF'S SUPPLEMENTAL RESPONSE TO DEFENDANTS MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGEMENT

## 1. INTRODUCTION

On December 29,2012, Defendants Paul Tolly and Terry Valentine used excessive force against Plaintiff Charles Raby at the Polunsky unit in the Texas Department of Criminal Justice. (TDCJ)
Raby and Tollys account of the incident at hand differ significantyly and create a genuine issue of material facts.

Both parties agree that Raby out of anger of being accused of drinking homemade alcohol in the day room tried to kick Tolly and Raby was being escorted to F-Pod from A-pod.

Raby was handcuffed behind his back at this time. And was taken down to the floor in a successful UOF.

But here, the accounts diverge greatly. Tolly claims the amount of force used was justified because CD Arron Floyd informed him that Raby was spitting and was biting him.

Raby Maintaines this is untrue and flat out impossible. (see Raby's first response to motion for summary judgement.)

Today, September 24,2015, Raby was once again allowed to view the UOF DVD and the Surveillance camera footage of the incident.

Again Raby would like to point out that while watching the footage it clearly shows that Raby did not kick Sgt Valentine in the head as he falsely states in his written report. (see surveillance DVD and Valentines incident report.) proving that he in fact lied.

But more so, Raby was able to view the handheld UOE recording and was able to see, the right side of his face, the FIRST attack where the court will see Tolly drop to his knees and start punching Raby in the face with a closed fist, striking Raby with enough force to break his nose, happened to the 'LEFT" side of Raby's face.

By viewing the DVDs the court will be able to see the start of brusies to the 'RIGHT' side of Raby's face, which is a result of the SECOND attack which was not recorded.

It is those brusies that lend support to Raby's claim that Tolly did in fact assault him a second and third time. Again, which was conveniently not preserved as was requested.

Raby was also able at this time able to see that where Tolly falsely states that Raby 'repetedly kicked him in the head and body', is flat out impossible as it is for Raby to have turned his head in such away to bite Floyd, whose left elbow was on Rabys left back shoulder.

Tolly is somewhat under and BEHIND, Raby, and by the court viewing the DVD, it will clearly see, nowhere near Raby's feet. So it is factually impossible for Raby to had kicked Tolly 'repetedly' in the head and body. (see surveillance DVD and Tollys written statement) clearly contradict one another.

Raby would also like to point out to the court, Raby was never received any form of disciplinary cases for 'spitting or bitting' Floyd or 'kicking' Valentine in the head. Because they are in fact untrue.

And Lastly Raby would like to bring to the attention to the court the medical examination which was recorded the next day by order Captian John Bolton which would had shown the court just how bad Raby was beaten. And the multiple fist markings to Rabys face. Both sides.

Captian John Bolton is once again assigned to 12 building ,which is where Raby is housed. Today as raby was allowed to view the DVDs in the Majors office,with Major Dawson ,CO Cooper, and some new CO whom is a OJT, On the Job trainee. Captian John Bolton was also

present in the viewing. Raby took this time to engage Capt Bolton in a conversation about the medical examination recording. Capt Bolton with clearity informed Raby he turned it in and it should be part of the UOF Packet. Which is not.

Raby has made repeted reference to Defendants attorney Mrs Trevino to speak with the actual people involved in the recording of the medical examination the next day, only to be ignored, and told that she was told there is no such recording, there never was and no reason to do so.

Captian Bolton admiting to this in frount of numerous people is Proof the recording did in fact exist. Which has been destroyed.

Bolton also stated the he recalled the incident being recorded from mulitple cameres. Which have been destroyed.

Raby respectfully ask the court to view the DVDS and watch for the things that DID NOT happen, the 'repeted kicks to the head and body'to Paul Tolly, the 'kick to the head' to Valentine, the 'spitting and bitting' to CO Floyd. All of which are impossible. And lies.

Raby would like to point out to the court to help identify the people involved.

Tolly is to the left of Plaintiff, Valentine to the right, Watch as valentine falls onto the fall, and down onto his rear, and AWAY from Raby's feet, making it impossible for Raby to had kicked him on the right side of his head.

Floyd is the one whom comes from into camera view and behind. and who is at the upper part of rabys body, Valentine punching Raby in the side.

And to again point to the court to view the right side of Raby's face, and it is those markings which are the result of the second third Beating, both of were to the right side of Rabys face.

#### 2 ARGUEMENT

Raby's injuries are sufficiently serious for the 8th amendment

excessive use of force claim to survive summary judgement.

Determining whether a given harm is sufficient for the purposes of an excessive force under the Crule and Unusual punishment Clause is a 'contexual' inquiry that is 'responsive to 'contemporary standards of decency'" Hudson V. McMillian 503 U.S.i,4 (1992) (quoting Estelle v. gamble 429 U.S 97, 103 (1976)). Even though 'prison discipline may require that inmates endure relatively greater physical contact, the 8th amendment is nontheless violated if the 'offending conduct reflects an unnecessary and wanton infliction of pain.

For excessive force claims brough be prisoners and per trial detainees "[t]he core judicial inquiry is ...'whether force was applied in good faitheffort to maintain and restore discipline, or maliciously and sadistically to cause harm.'" Baldin v. Stalder 137 F.3d 836 838 (5th cir 1998) (quoting Hudson 503 U.S at 7) accord Gomez v Chandler 162 F3d 921,923 (5thcir 1999) Because the motive of the officer is offten discernible, the trier of fact must base its dermination on relavant objective factors suggestive of intent. Some of the factors that must be considered in determining whether unnecessary and wanton infliction of pain was utilized in violation of a prisoners 8th amendment right to be free from crule and unusual punishment include

- 1. the extent of the injury suffered
- 2. the need for the application of force
- 3. the relationship between the need and the amount of force used
- 4. the threat reasonable percived by the responseible official and
- 5. any effort made to temper the serverity of a forceful response

Dropping to ones knees and beating a handcufed man who is being held down belly to the floor, with a closed fist with enough force to break bone is not a effort made to temper the serverity of a forceful response. And is objectively unreasonable.

Here there remains a genuine issue of material fact as to whether Tolly applied force maliciously or to restore order. Raby Maintains that Tolly was mad and upset for Raby having him called to come and personally talk to him and when Raby struck out at Tolly, Tolly

with a well documented history of beating up on handcuffed prisoners took it out on Raby by beating him not once as was preserved on footage, but also a second and third times which was not preserved as was requested.

A fact is 'material' if is might effect the outcome of the suit under governing law. Bazan ex rel. Bazan v. Hideldo county 246 F.3d 481,489 (5thi cir 2001) (emphasis in original) (quoting Anderson,477 U.S Ct 2025) Factual disputes that are irrelevant or unnecessary qill not be counted. An issuse is 'genuine' if it is real and substantial, as opposed to merely formal. pertend, or a sham. Thus a genuine issue of material fact exist 'if the evidence is such that a reasonable jury could return a verdict for the nonmoving party. Anderson 477 U.S at 248 106 S.CT 2025; accord EMCASCO Inc.Co. V. American Int'l Specialty lines Inc.Co. 438 F3d 519,523 (5th Cir 2006)

Once a proper motion has been made, the nonmoving party may not rest upon mere allegaltions or denials in the pleadings but must present affirmative affirmative evidence, setting forth specific facts to show the existence of a genuine issue for trial. (FED R.CIV P 56(e). The court must review the record 'taken as a whole'. All evidence must be construed 'in light' most favorable to the non-moving party' without weighing the evidence, assesing it probative value or resolving any factual disputes. The evidence of the non movant is to be believed, with all justifiable inferences drawn and all reasonable doubt resolved in his favor. See Palmer v. BRG of Ga, Inc 498 U.S.46,49 n.5,111 S.Ct 401 112 L.Ed.2d 349 (1990).Shields v. Twiss 389 F.3d 142 150 (5th cir 2004).

The evidence is construed 'in favor of the nonmoving party, however, only when an actual contradicitory facts. Olabisiomotosho v. City of Houston 185 F.3d 521, 525 (5th cir \$999) See Almond v. Tarver 468 F.Supp 2d 886 (2006).

Raby respectfully points out to the court that, if the Defendant's will lie and make false allegations in light of video evidence which clearly contradicts their written statements, what else will they lie about? What else have they lied about? In order to cover up the

excessive use of force. Including the second and third beating to the RIGHT side on Raby's face, which the court upon looking closely at the DVD will surely see bruises to the right side as well as the left. Proof of a second and third beating to the right side of Rabys face. Which they make zero mention of and failed to preserve as was requested and was TDCJ Policy.

Lastly, Raby would like to point one last thing about the written statement. It states 'Tolly fell forward landing on his head with his upper body being trapped between the offender les and head under Sgt Valentine. Offender Raby took advantage of the situation and began to kick Lt Tolly in the head, legs, and abdominal area.'

All of this is false. It is clear that Sgt valentine falls backward onto his rear end and Tollys head is nowhere nearbeing 'trapped' under Valentine, and it is clear that Raby did NOT kick Tolly in rapid succession striking Tolly in the head. legs and abdominal area. just more lies to help cover up and protect one of their own. For nobody viewing these videos could read these statements as anything but false. And were written to cause Raby harm. For these statements would be used in any criminal proceedings that could follow.

#### CONCLUSION

Raby again asks the court to DENY defendants motion for summary judgement. (see Plaintiff's first response to defendant's motion for Summary Judgement.) When you eliminate the impossibles, what will remian is the truth.

respertfully Submitted

Charles Douglas Raby,pro se

Charles Douglas Raby TDCJ ID # 999109 3872 FM 350 South Livingston Tx 77351

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I Charles D.Raby,certify that on September 28,2015, a copy of the foregoing has been placed in the U.S.POSTAL mail, (Plaintiff's supplement response to Defendant's motion for Summary Judgement) Addressed to Defendant's attorney of record Mer Afton Trevino assistant attorney general P.O.BOX 12548
Austin Tx 787111

Charles Raby Pro se

## TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF CRIMINAL JUSTICE Use of Force Report

Employee Participant Statement Unit (Name and Alpha Code): A-06871-12-12 Report Number: Incident Number (if applicable): I. INSTRUCTIONS • Complete Section II.a, through II.e, checking and completing all that apply in each section; At Section II.f, in as much detail as possible, describe what happened <u>before</u>, <u>during</u>, and <u>after</u> the use of force occurred, including: - Time or approximate time of use of force; - Name and rank or title of each employee involved; and - Name of each offender involved; - Description of employee and offender injuries, if any. II. STATEMENT a. Printed Name: Date/time force was used: /2-29-/2 b. Location where use of force occurred: 12 Guilding Main hallway c. PRIOR TO implementing force, did you do any of the following: YES NO If 'NO,' explain why: U \* Listen to the offender? W \* Attempt to calm or reason with the offender? \* Explain the consequences? M Notify the supervisor? V Request a video camera and operator? Secure the area? ntaneous use of force Request additional staff to make a visible show of force? Use restraining devices? If answer is 'YES' to any of these, describe in detail, at Section f, how this was accomplished. d. In describing offender behavior, specify which offender(s) and whether it occurred before or during the use of force. Before Durina Offender Name(s) / TDCJ Number(s): Assaulted another offender with weapon Assaulted another offender without weapon, such as by kicking, shoving, П pushing, slapping, hitting, or grabbing П Assaulted staff or another person, not an offender, with weapon 团 Assaulted staff or another person, not an offender, without weapon Raby Sharles/999109  $\Box$ Attempted escape Attempted suicide or self-mutilation Attempted to assault staff or another person, not an offender, with weapon Attempted to assault staff or another person, not an offender, without weapon  $\Box$ Created a disturbance or riot Damaged or destroyed state property V Displayed abnormal behavior Obstructed tray slot or cell door P Pulled away from staff Refused to accept a housing assignment Refused medically ordered treatment Refused photo I.D. or fingerprinting, during intake or update Refused strip search or restraint procedures Refused to leave or enter a housing area

Raby UOF pg 20

page 1 of 2

Refused to submit to forensic or DNA collection

Swore at or verbally threatened staff

UOF-1 (2012)

Unit (Nam	e and Alpha Code): Polunsky TZ	\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\
Report Nu	mber: MA-0687/- /2 - /2 Incident Number (if applicable):	11
e. Describ	pe your actions. If more than one offender noted in Section II.d, identify against which offender your action was taken:	- 1 7 M
		1 V K
	Shoved or pushed offender:	1 3 2
	Used restraining holds on:	3 9
	Used restraining device(s) on: Raby Charles 1999 109	1 / 13
]	If so, what type & why? Type: hand restraints Reason: escorting the offender	1
	Data/time weeks Data: 12/2 a / 27 mg. 1474	5
		\ \ \
	Struck offender with fist or open hand:	16 6
	If so, how many times? What part of the body was struck?	1 % /
	Kicked offender:	1
	If so, how many times? What part of the body was struck?	0
	Tribit part of the body was struck?	1 6 1
	Used riot baton on:	,
	If so, how many times was the offender struck? What part of the body was struck?	1 2
	Used chemical agents on:	133
-	If so what trop?	1 8 1/2
_	How much?	1 6
	Used deadly force against:	6 51
	If so, describe firearm and ammunition used; give manufacturer's serial number; how many rounds fired?	5 3
	Other (Explain):	\$ 3
	italement: On 12-29-2012 at approximately 1433 hours I officer Agron Floyd COIN	7 6
the Officer pper back t. Tolly s the Officer the Officer and a Via telescant the officer telescant	Let Raby, Charles "1993 109. Said Offender was being excepted from AF day room to FF78 was discovered that he was intoxicated in the dagroom once in the hollowy the Offender was being excepted from AF day room to FF78 what speck to lieutengat Paul Tolly, Lt. Tolly and Sqt. Volentine took over the escort with hollowing behind as they spoke with the Offender. With no warning the Offender suddenly with his right leg striking Lt. Tolly in his side. The Offenders Calance was comprayinged as red kicking Lt. Tolly striking him several times as we fell to the floor. Incommend the Offenders and the Offenders continued to kick until SST. Valentine Testimed his less. I restrained the Offenders and the Offenders and the Offenders for the Me grazing my left elbowy. Informed the Offenders loss to the Me grazing my left elbowy. Informately the Offenders begin to Spit and attempted to the Me grazing my left elbowy. Informately the Offenders loss to the Me grazing my left elbowy. The Who was tangled in the Offenders loss to talk mes with a close of 1954 while ordering who was tangled in the Offenders loss to talk arrive on the Secre with log restrain Jet of thing. Officer Afron Baker collidia arrive on the Secre with log restrain Jet to stop liting. Officer Afron Baker collidia arrive on the Secre with log restrain Jet to stop liting. Officer Afron Baker collidia arrive on the Secre with log restrain Jet to stop liting. Officer Afron Baker collidia arrive on the Secre with log restrain Jet to stop liting. Officer Afron Baker collidia arrive on the Secre with log restrain Jet to stop liting arrive of with a second video cancra and operator Jonie Brower Collider Cancra and operator Jonie Brower Collider arrive of with a second video cancra and operator Jonie Brower Colliders and Soft Arrived Milles had myself and Soft Valentine relieved by Officers and Formatical Arrived to Milles arrived with a second video cancra and operator Jonie Brower Colliders and soft	Keing a.
o the best of	Continuation page(s) attached	
	my knowledge, the information submitted in this participant statement is complete and accurate.	
<b>-</b> ,-,	n Flord COI	1
Printed Nar	Rank or Title and Social Security No.	
11-12	12/29/2012	
Signature	Date	
IOF-1 (2012)		
th	THIS STATEMENT CLEARLY IS WRONG. AND GOES NOT A  Wichen Floyd , & She work link.  Raby UOF pg 21	anth

Unit (Name and A	lpha Code): Polunsky	TL
Report Number:	06871-12-12	Incident Number (if applicable):
		IV. SUMMARY
Instructions: Al	ter reading all stateme escribe efforts made to	ents and reviewing videotape footage, explain what happened <u>before,</u> <u>during</u> , and <u>after</u> the use of force defuse situation; if there are no offender witnesses, explain why.
Participants:		Rank/ TDCJ #
Officers:	Tolly, Paul Valentine, Terry	Lieutenant Sergeant
	Floyd, Aaron	COIV
Offender:	Raby, Charles	999109
Witnesses:	Brewer, Jamie	COIV
	Baker, Aaron	COIV
	Morris, Thomas	COIII
	Grimm, Scott	COIII
	Miles, Brandon Beard, Nathon	Sergeant COV
seach and plinto the hallw Paul Tolly. L. Tolly and toward Lt. To right leg and attempt to pla backwards or also struck by floor. Sgt. Va forward landir Offender Rab area. In attenthe offender. Officer Floyd Lt. Tolly freed informed Lt. T and viewed O biting and spit causing a scrafacial area to sabdominal are Additional staf control of Offe instructed by L restraints and radio for a buil Beard. Sgt. Virestraint. Scott camera and a Officer Brewer incident. Sgt. N	A pod AF dayroom to acced the offender in hay enroute to 12F-78 t. Tolly responded and Sgt. Valentine escorted ly and kicked him with Lt. Tolly quickly grabbice him against the warm of the offender as he feather that had been as the offender as he feather to free himself and This action caused the way took advantage of the public had been as able to gain control himself and This action caused the way to have a been as a be	⊠ Continuation page(s) attached
		V. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT
the best of my kno	wledge, the information	submitted is complete and accurate.
Paul Tolly	Lieuten	
Supervisor (Printed	Name/Rank or Title)	Signature/Date (1323/2372

UOF-6 (2012)

page 2 of 2

# TEXAS DEPARTMENT OF CRIMINAL JUSTICE Use of Force Report

Continuation Page

Unit (Name and Alpha	Code): Polunsky	TL
Report Number:	06871-12-12	Incident Number (if applicable):
		I. INFORMATION PROVIDED BY
Paul Tolly		
Printed Employee or	Offender Name	Lieutenant  Rank or Title or TDCJ No.
		II. ADDITIONAL INFORMATION
This is a continuation of	of information which I bear	n to provide on the (Enter form number) UOF6
injuries. Offender the leg restraints secured. The foo hand restraints ar Offender Raby's form to him and (incident. All three pinky finger. Sgt. offender Particip	ted Officer Grimm and r Raby was escorted to removed. Offender R. d tray slot was opened d secured the tray slot facial area which was Diffender Raby refused staff participants received ar Valentine received ar his injury to his facial pant form. LVN Robert	Raby was assisted to his feet by Officer Grimm and Morris and escorted to 12 Bldg F Pod. If Morris to stop outside of F pod. Sgt. Miles took front and back photos and photos of 12 Bldg F-78 cell. Sgt. Miles ordered Offender Raby to kneel down at the cell door to have aby complied with the orders. Officer Morris removed the leg restraints and the door was and Offender Raby placed his hands through the food tray slot. Officer Morris removed the RN Lisa Curry performed a cell side use of force screening, notating a superficial injury to a non-serious. Sgt. Miles read the UOF-2 form to the offender and attempted to give the the form. Sgt Miles terminated the use of force. There were no offender witnesses to the red a injuries up to first aid. LT. Tolly received an injury to his knee, shin, elbow, and his left injury to the left side of his face. Officer Floyd received an injury to his left arm. The area from the closed fist strikes. Offender Raby refused to accept and complete an Sears was in the area but did not participate in the use of force screenings. The telex has the of the officer was at 14:40. Due to the confined space in some of the areas, Officer
Brewer was not al	ole to keep a full view o	f the offender on video at all times.
		☐ Continuation page(s) attached
the best of my knowle	the the information sub-	nitled is complete and accurate.
_ \	7	
Signature		12/29/2012 Date
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		` IV. TRANSLATED BY (If applicable)
the best of my knowle	edge, the foregoing inform	ation is an accurate account of information provided by:
Offender:		
	Printed Name	TDCJ No.
Employee Translator:		
ey Handidon	Printed Name	Rank or Title
	Signature	Date
of-8 (2012)		

Raby UOF pg 13

### 25 september 2015

To: Mr Maland U.S District Clerk

Re: raby v. Tolly et al

Civil action No 9:13-cv-120

Dear Mr Maland,

please find enclosed Plaintiffs supplement response to Defendants motion for summary Judgement.

To be filed with the court.

Thank you for you time in the matter.

Respectfully

Charles Raby, pro se

Charles Aby 599/69.

Polansky Un. †
3872 Fm 350 S.

Live 5/2 /x 77357

U.S. Dispect Clerk
104. N. Third 87
LUFKIN TX 75908